Checklist of Tenure & Promotion Procedures for Departmental Promotion and Tenure Committees (PTCs), Department Chairs, and Deans

Jacqui Bergman, Vice Provost for Faculty Affairs
September 27, 2019 (revised date)
Please address questions or comments to bergmanjz@appstate.edu or ext. 2643

All citations to sections are to the 2019-2020 Faculty Handbook. See also Notifications and Statement of Reasons for Reappointment, Emeritus Status, and Tenure and Promotion.

☐ Department has tenure & promotion guidelines.
☐ Department is aware of and considers college, Handbook and UNC system criteria and avoids consideration of “impermissibles” (as reflected in Code 604 and Policy Manual 101.3.1). Departments should use 4.4.2 [see text on second page of this document] to guide all deliberations and recommendations.
☐ Annual reviews conducted (4.3.2).
☐ Reappointment conducted (4.4).
☐ Candidate has been mentored regarding tenure and promotion requirements and process, and mentored to determine if he or she will go up early? (3.8.5.13.).
☐ PTC Chair was elected by September 15 and received required training (4.1.6.3).
☐ PTC properly constituted and organized (4.1.6).
☐ Dossier prepared as provided in section (4.4.4-6).
☐ Faculty member notified in writing ten working days in advance of PTC meeting at which case is considered (4.4.3). Note that a message to the whole department counts as notification for the candidate. Note also that e-mail notification is sufficient.
☐ Members of department are notified of PTC meeting and agenda prior to meeting (4.1.8.2).
☐ Tenure track faculty—those not recused—know that they may speak with the PTC (4.1.8.2). The candidate being considered for promotion or tenure has a right to speak before the PTC (4.4.3). It is not strictly required to notify either tenure-track faculty or the candidate that they have a right to speak, but it is best practice, and this reminder can be done at the time that the written notification of the meeting is made.
The candidate was not dissuaded from speaking to PTC. Regardless of what departmental practice has been, all candidates have a right to speak to the PTC if they choose to do so.

The faculty member’s entire portfolio was considered by PTC.

If other materials were submitted, they were properly handled (4.3.1.1). Materials to be considered may not be added to a personnel file within five working days of a decision.

The confidentiality of the candidate’s dossier and other personnel file materials has been maintained. The dossier is considered to be part of the personnel file. Unless the candidate waives rights of confidentiality or some special circumstances exist, only the candidate, PTC members, chair, dean, other senior administrators, provost, and chancellor are permitted to view dossiers (especially 4.12 and 4.12.6).

PTC meeting was conducted properly (4.4 & 4.1-4.3).

Quorum was present for meeting.

Motion was phrased affirmatively (4.1.8.7). That is, “I move that Candidate X be recommended for tenure,” or words to that effect.

Recusals handled properly (4.1.8.8).

Absentee ballots are counted if addressed to motion at hand (4.1.8.3).

PTC and Chair avoided consideration of “impermissibles?” (4.4.2 highlighted below).
PTC members, chairs, and deans should refer to “Notifications and Statements of Reason for Reappointment, Emeritus Status, Tenure, and Promotion; and Procedures for Promotion and Tenure Committees” for detailed guidance on the steps below.

PTC members submit vote justification forms to the PTC chair within three working days (4.1.8.4).

Minutes of PTC are in order (4.1.8.5-7).

Department chair notifies candidate of PTC recommendation within three working days (4.1.8.11).

Department chair notifies the dean and faculty member of the departmental chair’s recommendation generally within five working days via a letter with an explanation of the reasons for both the chair’s and the promotion and tenure committee’s recommendations (4.4.7).

It is highly important that PTC minutes reflect what was considered. Essentially, the minutes need only state that criteria such as teaching, scholarship, service, and other valid institutional interests were considered. The minutes need not go into detail regarding the discussion. The PTC should not discuss or use any considerations that are impermissible under Section 4.4.2. It is the responsibility of every person present at a PTC meeting to ensure that no impermissible considerations are discussed and that any possible violations of procedure are reported to the Office of Academic Affairs, Dr. Jacqui Bergman, Vice Provost for Faculty Affairs.

4.4.2 The decision to reappoint, promote or tenure a faculty member may be based on any factor(s) considered relevant to the total institutional interests, but those responsible for making the decision must consider the faculty member’s demonstrated professional competence, potential for future contribution, and institutional needs and resources. A decision not to reappoint, promote or tenure may not be based upon (1) the faculty member’s exercise of rights guaranteed by either the First Amendment to the United States Constitution or Article I of the North Carolina Constitution; (2) unlawful discrimination based upon the faculty member’s race, color, national origin, religion, sex, gender identity and expression, political affiliation, age, disability, veteran status, genetic information or sexual orientation; or (3) personal malice. For purposes of this section, the term “personal malice” means dislike, animosity, ill will, or hatred based on personal characteristics, traits or circumstances of an individual that are not relevant to valid University decision making. See UNC Policy 101.3.1 II.B for details.
### 4.4.7 The departmental chair shall notify the faculty member of the results of a departmental promotion and tenure committee vote on reappointment, emeritus status, tenure, or promotion within **three working days** following the date of the promotion and tenure committee vote, except under extenuating circumstances. Notification to the dean and to the faculty member of the chair’s recommendation to the dean on promotion, tenure, reappointment, or emeritus status **shall be made in a timely manner as defined by the college or school, not to exceed five working days, except under extenuating circumstances.** The departmental chair shall give the dean of the particular college/school the results of the promotion and tenure committee vote, written vote justification statements, and the P&T Dossier (4.4.5.1 and 4.4.6) submitted by the faculty member. **For reappointment, emeritus status, tenure, and promotion, the chair’s letter shall include an explanation of the reason(s) for the chair’s and promotion and tenure committee’s recommendation as well as the outcome of the promotion and tenure committee’s vote.** The faculty member shall receive a copy of this letter when the chair forwards the recommendation to the dean.

---

- **Required materials (and only required materials) are forwarded from the department to the dean (4.1.8.10 and 4.4.6).**
- **Dean notifies faculty member of dean’s recommendation at the time when the recommendation and materials are forwarded to the provost (4.4.8).**
- **Dean’s recommendation states reasons for the recommendation (4.4.8).**
- **Other matters including duties of the Provost, Chancellor, Board of Trustees, and Board of Governors; notifications of non-reappointments, and grievance rights are not addressed in this checklist.**